

94 Victoria Terrace
Dunfermline
Fife
KY12 0LU
Tel: 01383 729869

E-Mail: tomminogue@btinternet.com

Angus Hogg, Chairman
Carnegie Dunfermline Trust
Abbey Park House
Abbey Park Place
Dunfermline
Fife
KY12 7PB

Hand delivered to the above address & e-mailed.

Monday 23rd October 2006.

Dear Mr Hogg,

Audited accounts for the Carnegie Dunfermline Trust to 31st December 2005.

Thank you for sending me a copy of the above to which I would seek clarification as follows:

Your annual accounts for 2005 show that you disposed of "Investment heritable property" that was worth £450,000, apparently on the basis of a valuation in December 2002.

Can you tell me what was the nature of the property that was disposed of, who was it sold to and what sum did the Trust receive?

It appears that the Trust made a profit of £15,861 on that sale. Is that correct? As the property had not been valued for 3 years, and property prices had increased substantially over that period, this appears to be a modest gain. Can you say why this is so and where the sale was advertised?

What is the value, if any, of Pittencrieff Park in the Trust's balance sheet?

Could you also advise me of the nature of the remaining "Investment heritable property?"

Finally on a separate matter can you provide me with a set of audited accounts for the Carnegie Hero Trust for the same period?

Thanking you in anticipation of your assistance.

Yours sincerely,

Tom Minogue.



CARNEGIE

DUNFERMLINE TRUST

Tom Minogue
94 Victoria Terrace
Dunfermline
KY12 0LU

31 October 2006

Dear Mr. Minogue,

Angus Hogg has asked me to reply to your letter of 23 October with regard the accounts for the Carnegie Dunfermline Trust.

In response to your queries, Pittencrieff Park is not included in any of the accounts of the Trust and the investment heritable property forms part of the overall investment portfolio, any recorded sales or adjustments in value of which relate to the portfolio as a whole, not single properties.

Since I understand that you wish to view the 1979 Supplementary Charter again a copy of the Hero Fund accounts will be available for collection when you come in.

Yours sincerely,

Nora T C Rundell

ABBAY PARK HOUSE, ABBAY PARK PLACE
DUNFERMLINE FIFE KY12 7PB
TEL: 01383 723638 FAX: 01383 721862 E-MAIL: admin@carnegietrust.com
CHIEF EXECUTIVE · NORA T C RUNDELL BA MBA MCM1 REGISTERED CHARITY NO. SCO 15710

94 Victoria Terrace
Dunfermline
Fife
KY12 0LU
Tel: 01383 729869

E-Mail: tomminogue@btinternet.com

Angus Hogg, Chairman
Carnegie Dunfermline Trust
Abbey Park House
Abbey Park Place
Dunfermline
Fife
KY12 7PB

Hand delivered to the above address & e-mailed.

Thursday 9th November 2006.

Dear Mr Hogg,

Audited Accounts for the Carnegie Dunfermline Trust to 31st December 2005.

I wrote to you on 23rd October 2006 seeking clarification of certain points I raised in connection with the above. I raised four separate queries and made a request for the audited accounts of the Hero Trust. Your letter of 31st October answers one query and confirms that the Hero Trust accounts are available for uplift.

Can you advise me if you intend providing the clarification to the three outstanding matters that I raised in my letter?

Thanking you in anticipation of your assistance.

Yours sincerely,

Tom Minogue.



CARNEGIE

DUNFERMLINE TRUST

Tom Minogue
94 Victoria Terrace
Dunfermline
KY12 0LU

28 November 2006

Dear Mr. Minogue,

I refer to your letters of 9 November and your observations relating to the audited accounts for 2005. The Chairman has asked me to respond on his behalf.

The information published in both the Annual Report and the Accounts is in line with the working practice of the Trust and the changing statutory accounting and legal requirements. Policy and management decisions relating to investments, longterm funding projects and grant distribution year on year are of course the business of the Trust. We have however noted your comments and you will find that many of the queries you raise relate to activities and projects in the community which were fully covered at the time in the appropriate media and indeed the annual report.

Yours sincerely,

Nora T C Rundell

ABBAY PARK HOUSE, ABBAY PARK PLACE
DUNFERMLINE FIFE KY12 7PB

TEL: 01383 723638 FAX: 01383 721862 E-MAIL: admin@carnegietrust.com
CHIEF EXECUTIVE: NORA T C RUNDELL BA MBA MCMJ REGISTERED CHARITY NO. SCO 15710

94 Victoria Terrace
Dunfermline
Fife
KY12 0LU
Tel: 01383 729869

E-Mail: tomminogue@btinternet.com

Angus Hogg, Chairman
Carnegie Dunfermline Trust
Abbey Park House
Abbey Park Place
Dunfermline
Fife
KY12 7PB

By E-Mail and First Class Post
Saturday 2nd December 2006.

Dear Mr Hogg,

Audited Accounts for the Carnegie Dunfermline Trust to 31st December 2005.

I refer to your letter of 28th November in reply to my queries of 23rd October 2006, and 9th November 2006 relating to the above.

I would ask you to reconsider your decision to refuse my reasonable request for information that should be available to members of the public. I would remind you that the information I seek from the Trust is in respect of information which was governed by the terms of the Royal Charter of 1919 and the letter from Andrew Carnegie of 1903.

I would also point out that the information I seek with regard to "Investment heritable property" and individual grants is information, which, in the past, by right and precedent has been available to the public by a simple reference to the audited accounts.

The detailed audited accounts which should be published in the local press are placed in the Public Library (see file attached). Surely it cannot be the case that in a reversal of the modern trend towards openness and accountability as the years pass the Trust becomes more secretive in its dealings with the public?

Thanking you in anticipation of your assistance.

Yours sincerely,

Tom Minogue.
File attachments 2.