

94 Victoria Terrace  
Dunfermline  
Fife  
Scotland  
KY12 0LU  
**Tel: 01383 729869**

**E-Mail: [tomminogue@btinternet.com](mailto:tomminogue@btinternet.com)**

Vartan Gregorian  
President  
Carnegie Corporation of New York  
437 Madison Avenue  
New York,  
New York 10022  
USA

Friday 13<sup>th</sup> October 2006

Dear Mr Gregorian,

Pittencrieff Park, Dunfermline (known locally as The Glen).

I understand from a contact close to the Carnegie Dunfermline & Hero Trust (The Dunfermline Trust) that on 3<sup>rd</sup> October of last year when you were in Dunfermline to formally open the Andrew Carnegie Business School at Lauder College you were approached by members of The Dunfermline Trust and Fife Council who sought your advice and help with their financial problems.

I also understand that you suggested that a possible solution to the cash flow problems of the Dunfermline Trust might be found in the Harvard Business School (with some of your fellow Trustees have links). The Harvard Business School it would appear are interested in setting up a European branch in keeping with their stated ambitions regarding globalisation and the picturesque setting of The Glen would no doubt appeal to them.

Although my information is hearsay it is from a reliable source and I understand that the feasibility study currently being carried out in The Glen by Mace and Scottish Enterprise is on behalf of the Harvard Business School. This topic has been the subject of much speculation in the press and though it has been denied by both The Trust and Harvard I am told on good authority that these denials are simply aimed at providing commercial confidentiality to a project that may or may not come to fruition.

I will proceed with my submission to you on the basis that what I have been told is true and there is in fact a possibility of Harvard Business School setting up a school in The Glen.

It is a matter of record that the current Dunfermline Trustees under the Chairmanship of Angus Hogg are keen on commercially developing The Glen and they have recently applied for changes to their Royal Charter to facilitate such development. Sadly the Dunfermline Trust—in a move that was in total disregard for the founders wishes—did not tell the people what they were doing when they sought to change terms in the 1919 Royal Charter.

The Royal Charter guaranteed the Trustees **almost** complete discretion as to what they bought and sold vis: “This Charter shall be sufficient warrant to the Corporation to uplift and realise the same, **excepting** the aforesaid property in Dunfermline acquired by the said Andrew Carnegie from James Maitland Hunt of Pittencrieff; **which is to be held in perpetuity for the purposes expressed in the said aforementioned Trust Deed and relative letter** [Emphasis added].

The purposes expressed in the said letter—which is an integral part of the Royal Charter—are purely recreational and limited to the toiling masses or poor people of Dunfermline. Whatever else a Harvard Business School is, it is not a means of recreation for the people. This fact and the secretive charter changes have enraged many local people including myself and some of us have been active in opposing any commercial development in the people’s park. So far over 5,000 signatures have been collected in support of this view. Local celebrities have joined the protest and the Queen and Prince Charles have become involved.

I realise that you probably acted in good faith in facilitating contact with Harvard but those who approached you with a view to Harvard establishing a site in The Glen did not have the authority, morally or legally to offer the site for development of this sort. This would be in breach of the specific terms of the gift Andrew Carnegie left to the people of Dunfermline.

This was a very special gift—even for Andrew Carnegie the father of philanthropy who said in his autobiography:

*“No gift I have made or can ever make can possibly approach that of Pittencrieff Glen, Dunfermline....*

*The Glen is unique, as far as I know. It adjoins the Abbey and Palace grounds, and on the west and north it lies along two of the main streets of the town. Its area (between sixty and seventy acres) is finely sheltered, its high hills grandly wooded. It always meant paradise to the child of Dunfermline. It certainly did to me. When I heard of paradise, I translated the word into Pittencrieff Glen, believing it to be as near to paradise as anything I could think of”.*

*“It is twelve years since the Glen was handed over to the trustees and certainly no public park was ever dearer to a people. The children's yearly gala day, the flower shows and the daily use of the Park by the people are surprising. The Glen now attracts people from neighboring towns. In numerous ways the trustees have succeeded finely in the direction indicated in the trust deed, namely: To bring into the monotonous lives of the toiling masses of Dunfermline, more "of sweetness and light," to give to them—especially the*

*young—some charm, some happiness, some elevating conditions of life which residence elsewhere would have denied, that the child of my native town, looking back in after years, however far from home it may have roamed, will feel that simply by virtue of being such, life has been made happier and better”.*

So despite the unique character of the gift and its special place in the hearts of the people identified by the donor, The Dunfermline Trust tell us, the beneficiaries, that we must move with the times. This argument is a fig-leaf to hide their bad stewardship of the assets of the Trust. The Dunfermline Trust has since 1976 have been unable to cut the grass or otherwise care for the park. They rely on the Fife Council doing their duties for them—at the ratepayer’s cost. The toiling masses subsidising their own inheritance! Now Fife Council are also in financial difficulties and it would appear that they are putting pressure on the Dunfermline Trust to pay their way by maximising their asset—leasing or selling parts of The Glen.

Another argument the Trustees use to disguise their stewardship shortcomings is the economic one. They say that a business school or other service industry project would lead to the creation of jobs in the service sector companies dealing with the school in what is an economic black spot. Few would argue with this, as it is a fact that service industries do indeed contribute much to the local and national economy, but The Glen is not a business park—it is a recreation park where workers take their leisure. It would be unthinkable to imagine a similar scenario whereby in 1920—when the local economy was similarly depressed— the Trustees had allowed local businessmen to build the industries of the time to alleviate unemployment. Would it have been acceptable for steel mills, engineering works or coal mines to have been located on the edge of the Glen? Of course not—and it is not acceptable in the twenty first century!

In conclusion I would ask you to read the book entitled “Pittencrieff Glen—Its Antiquities, History & Legends” which is enclosed as a C.D. in PDF form. The book contains the original Trust Deed and letter from Andrew Carnegie which makes it clear that this property is unique. It was left so that it would pass down through the generations of the citizens of Dunfermline—it is not a piece of land to be bought or sold—or leased for profit. As you have used your influence to facilitate the Harvard Business School to locate in Dunfermline I would respectfully ask you to use that same influence to persuade the potential developers to locate in any of the many sites suitable for development in the Dunfermline area where they would be welcome—but not in The Glen where they would not.

I will write separately to the Dean of Harvard Business School to express my concerns.

Yours sincerely,

Tom Minogue.  
Attachments: 1 C.D.

